# Newborn but dusty: The obscured(d) puzzle of EoR galaxies

# Laura Sommovigo



erc

In collaboration with:

A. Ferrara, S. Carniani, A. Pallottini,
T. Bakx, P. Dayal, S. Gallerani, L. Vallini,
A. Zanella & REBELS team













# Why do we care about dust?

Adapted from: Silva+98

Young stars

UV and optical radiation

Stars only 1014 1013 1012  $10^{11}$ 1000 100 0.1 10  $\log \lambda ~[\mu m]$ 

 $\log \lambda L_{\lambda} [10^{30} erg$ 

M82: local galaxy

# Why do we care about dust?

Adapted from: Silva+98



# Why do we care about dust?

IR and FIR

radiation

Young stars

UV and optical radiation

Dust grains

M82: local galaxy



### **Observational challenges at high-redshift**



Liang+19

### **Observational challenges at high-redshift**



Liang+19

### **Observational challenges at high-redshift**





Liang+19





















### **REBELS** ALMA Large Program



Reionization Era Bright Emission Line Survey (PI: Bouwens, co-PIs: Gonzalez, Inami, Stark)

**70-hours of Observations** 

For further details see: Bouwens+21

co-Is: Renske Smit, Pascal Oesch, Sander Schouws, Mauro Stefanon, Rebecca Bowler, Ryan Endsley, Manuel Aravena, Luca Graziani, Elisabete da Cunha, Cameron White, Jacqueline Hodge, Cindy Yuexing Li, Dominik Riechers, Yoshi Fudamoto, Ivo Labbe, Ilse de Looze, Rafaella Schneider, Themiya Nanayakkara, Paul van der Werf, Andrea Ferrara, Pratika Dayal, Andrea Pallottini, Alex Hygate, Laia Barrufet De Soto, Laura Sommovigo



### **REBELS** ALMA Large Program



**Reionization Era Bright Emission Line Survey** 

(PI: Bouwens, co-PIs: Gonzalez, Inami, Stark)

**70-hours of Observations** 

For further details see: Bouwens+21

First statistical sample of  $z \sim 7$  FIR continuum detected galaxies!



### **REBELS** ALMA Large Program



**Reionization Era Bright Emission Line Survey** 

(PI: Bouwens, co-PIs: Gonzalez, Inami, Stark)

**70-hours of Observations** 

For further details see: Bouwens+21

First statistical sample of  $z\sim7$  FIR continuum detected galaxies!



$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d}$$

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII}$$

 $D \propto Z \rightarrow \text{Dust to gas ratio}$ 

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \,\alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII}$$

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \,\alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII}$$

 $D \propto Z \rightarrow$  Dust to gas ratio  $\alpha_{\text{CII}} = \Sigma_{\text{gas}} / \Sigma_{\text{CII}} \rightarrow [\text{CII}]\text{-to-total gas}$ conversion factor

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \,\alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII}$$

DeLooze relation + Kennicutt-Schmidt relation  $\rightarrow \alpha_{\text{CII}}$ 

 $D \propto Z \rightarrow$  Dust to gas ratio

$$\alpha_{\text{CII}} = \Sigma_{\text{gas}} / \Sigma_{\text{CII}} \rightarrow [\text{CII}]\text{-to-total gas}$$
  
conversion factor

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \,\alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII}$$

DeLooze relation + Kennicutt-Schmidt relation  $\rightarrow \alpha_{CII}$ 



Inputs:	<b>Outputs:</b>	
[ <b>CII</b> ]	$\rightarrow$	Ma
Continuum	$\rightarrow$	Ta

 $D \propto Z \rightarrow \text{Dust to gas ratio}$ 

 $\alpha_{\rm CII} = \Sigma_{\rm gas} / \Sigma_{\rm CII} \rightarrow [{\rm CII}]$ -to-total gas

conversion factor

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \,\alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII}$$

DeLooze relation + Kennicutt-Schmidt relation  $\rightarrow \alpha_{CII}$ 



Inputs:	<b>Outputs:</b>	
[ <b>CII</b> ]	$\rightarrow$	Ma
Continuum	$\rightarrow$	Та

Method tested on several local and high-z galaxies: We recover  $T_d$  from "traditional" SED fitting within  $1\sigma$ 

 $D \propto Z \rightarrow \text{Dust to gas ratio}$ 

 $\alpha_{\rm CII} = \Sigma_{\rm gas} / \Sigma_{\rm CII} \rightarrow [{\rm CII}]$ -to-total gas

Sommovigo+21

conversion factor

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII} \qquad \begin{array}{l} D \propto Z \rightarrow {\rm Dust \ to \ gas \ ratio} \\ \alpha_{\rm CII} = \Sigma_{\rm gas} / \Sigma_{\rm CII} \rightarrow [{\rm CII}] {\rm -to}{\rm -total \ gas} \\ {\rm conversion \ factor} \end{array}$$

DeLooze relation + Kennicutt-Schmidt relation  $\rightarrow \alpha_{CII}$ 

















Sommovigo+22; See also: Dayal+22 & Ferrara+22, Topping+22



#### Sommovigo+22; See also: Dayal+22 & Ferrara+22, Topping+22



Sommovigo+22; See also: Dayal+22 & Ferrara+22, Topping+22



Sommovigo+22; See also: Dayal+22 & Ferrara+22, Topping+22



#### Sommovigo+22; See also: Dayal+22 & Ferrara+22, Topping+22
























 $T_d$  raises with redshift due to decreasing gas depletion time at high-z

Cosmic dust temperature evolution: a physical model 120 Our model:  $T_{\rm d} \propto \left[ \frac{(1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}})}{Z} \left( \frac{\rm Gyr}{t_{\rm dep}} \right) \right]^{1/6} \propto (1 + z)^{0.42}$ MACS0416-Y1 100 A2744-YD4 80 B14-65666  $T_{d}$  [K] Physical Model 60 0217-0 40 A1689-ZD1 REBELS J1211-0118 HZ6 ALPINE 20  $T_{\rm CMB}(z)$ HRS, CANDELS fields data 6 8 0 2 4 redshift



Cosmic dust temperature evolution: a physical model 120 Our model:  $-e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}} \int ({\rm Gyr}) \Big]^{1/6}$ MACS041  $\propto (1+z)^{0.42}$ 100  $T_{\rm d} \propto$ A2744-Y 80 B14-65666  $T_{d}$  [K] Physical Model 60  $\wedge$ 0217-0 40 A1689-ZD1 REBELS 11211-0118 HZ6 ALPINE 20  $T_{CMB}(z)$ HRS, CANDELS fields data 8 0 2 6 4 redshift







Sommovigo+22





Sommovigo+22

 $T_d$  only depends on <u>gas column density</u> (*metallicity*)



#### Summary

Thanks to REBELS, we can address these questions:

- What is the dust content of massive EoR galaxies? Dust masses vary in the range  $M_d \sim (0.9-3.6)1e7 M_{\odot}$ ;
- How do they build their dust masses?

Dust masses compatible with dust production from Supernovae except few outliers;

Which is the dust temperature of massive EoR galaxies?

Dust temperatures vary in the range 39 K  $< T_d < 58$  K; warmer dust possibly missed by current observations.

• Does the dust temperature evolve with redshift?



#### Sommovigo et al. in prep., See also: Dayal+22



Yes,  $T_d \propto (1+z)^{0.42}$  due to the decrease of the depletion times in early galaxies. At any z: scatter induced by optical depth and metallicity variations.

Contact: laura.sommovigo@sns.it

For SERRA simulations details, see: Pallottini+22



serra

Studying the spectrum of the simulated galaxy Zinnia at redshift z=6.7:



Sommovigo+21

Studying the spectrum of the simulated galaxy Zinnia at redshift z=6.7:



Studying the spectrum of the simulated galaxy Zinnia at redshift z=6.7:



Sommovigo+21

Studying the spectrum of the simulated galaxy Zinnia at redshift z=6.7:



Sommovigo+21

Studying the spectrum of the simulated galaxy Zinnia at redshift z=6.7:



Studying the spectrum of the simulated galaxy Zinnia at redshift z=6.7:



Studying the spectrum of the simulated galaxy Zinnia at redshift z=6.7:



 $\alpha_{\rm CII}$ : [CII]-to-total gas conversion factor

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII} \qquad D \propto Z \rightarrow \text{Dust to gas ratio} \\ \alpha_{\rm CII} = \Sigma_{\rm gas} / \Sigma_{\rm CII} \rightarrow [\text{CII}] \text{-to-total gas} \\ \text{conversion factor} \end{cases}$$

[CII]-SFR relation + Kenicutt-Schmidt relation  $\rightarrow \alpha_{\text{CII}} \propto \Sigma_{\text{SFR}}^{-0.29} \kappa_s^{-5/7} y^2$ 

 $\alpha_{\rm CII}$ : [CII]-to-total gas conversion factor

$$F_{\nu} = \frac{1+z}{d_{\rm L}^2} k_{\nu} \left[ B_{\nu}(T_{\rm d}) - B_{\nu}(T_{\rm CMB}) \right] M_{\rm d} = D \alpha_{\rm CII} L_{\rm CII}$$

 $D \propto Z \rightarrow$  Dust to gas ratio

$$\alpha_{\rm CII} = \Sigma_{\rm gas} / \Sigma_{\rm CII} \rightarrow [{\rm CII}]$$
-to-total gas conversion factor

[CII]-SFR relation + Kenicutt-Schmidt relation  $\rightarrow \alpha_{\text{CII}} \propto \Sigma_{\text{SFR}}^{-0.29} \kappa_s^{-5/7} y^2$ 



# Burstiness

parameter, ks

See also: Heidrman+10, Ferrara+19, Vallini+21,22



<u>New method</u> to derive  $T_d$  using [CII] information

Inputs:	Ου	itputs:
[ <b>CII</b> ]	$\rightarrow$	Md
Continuum	$\rightarrow$	Td



<u>New method</u> to derive  $T_d$  using [CII] information

Inputs:	Οι	itputs:
[CII]	$\rightarrow$	Md
Continuum	$\rightarrow$	$\mathbf{T}\mathbf{d}$

$$\overbrace{F_{158}(T_{\rm d,CII},k_{\rm s},\widetilde{Z,\Sigma_{\rm SFR},L_{\rm CII},y,z)=F_{158,\rm obs}}^{data}$$



<u>New method</u> to derive  $T_{i}$  using [CII] information

Inputs:	Ου	itputs:
[ <b>CII</b> ]	$\rightarrow$	Md
Continuum	$\rightarrow$	$\mathbf{T}\mathbf{d}$

$$data = F_{158}(T_{d,CII}, k_s, \overline{Z, \Sigma_{Md} L_{CII}, y}, z) = F_{158,obs}$$



<u>New method</u> to derive  $T_{i}$  using [CII] information

Inputs:	Ου	itputs:
[ <b>CII</b> ]	$\rightarrow$	Md
Continuum	$\rightarrow$	$\mathbf{T}\mathbf{d}$

$$data$$

$$F_{158}(T_{\rm d,CII}, k_{\rm s}, \overline{Z, \Sigma_{\rm SFR}, L_{\rm CII}, y, z)} = F_{158, \rm obs}$$


























# Local testing



## Local testing



Application of new method to ALPINE galaxies



Sommovigo et al. in prep.

 $L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV}$ 

$$L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV} \qquad \qquad \propto \rm SFR$$

$$L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV} \qquad \propto \rm SFR$$
  

$$\propto M_{\rm d} T_{\rm d}^{-6}$$

$$L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV} \qquad \propto \rm SFR$$
  
  $\propto M_{\rm g} T_{\rm d}^{-6}$ 

$$L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV} \qquad \propto \rm SFR$$
  

$$\propto M_{\rm g} T_{\rm d}^{6} \qquad \qquad T_{\rm d} \propto (t_{\rm dep} = M_{\rm g}/\rm SFR)^{-1/6}$$

$$L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV}$$

$$\propto SFR$$

$$T_{\rm d} \propto \left( \frac{1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}}{Z} \left( \frac{Gyr}{t_{\rm dep}} \right) \right)^{1/6}$$

$$T_{\rm d} \propto \left( t_{\rm dep} = M_{\rm g}/SFR \right)^{-1/6}$$

$$L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV} \qquad \propto SFR$$

$$\propto M_{\rm g} T_{\rm d}^{6} \qquad T_{\rm d} \propto (t_{\rm dep} = M_{\rm g}/\rm{SFR})^{-1/6} \qquad T_{\rm d} \propto \left[\frac{(1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}})}{Z} \left(\frac{\rm Gyr}{t_{\rm dep}}\right)\right]^{1/6}$$
Redshift dependent

$$\begin{cases} M_{\rm g} = f_{\rm b} M (1 - \epsilon_{\star}) \\ \text{SFR} = \epsilon_{\star} f_{\rm b} \left\langle \frac{dM}{dt} \right\rangle \end{cases}$$

$$L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV} \qquad \propto SFR$$

$$\propto M_{\rm g} T_{\rm d}^{6} \qquad T_{\rm d} \propto (t_{\rm dep} = M_{\rm g}/\rm{SFR})^{-1/6} \qquad T_{\rm d} \propto \left[\frac{(1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}})}{Z} \left(\frac{\rm Gyr}{t_{\rm dep}}\right)\right]^{1/6}$$
Redshift dependent











$$L_{\rm IR} = (1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}}) L_{\rm UV}$$

$$\propto SFR$$

$$M_{\rm g} T_{\rm d}^{6}$$

$$T_{\rm d} \propto (t_{\rm dep} = M_{\rm g}/\rm{SFR})^{-1/6}$$

$$T_{\rm d} \propto \left[\frac{(1 - e^{-\tau_{\rm UV}})}{Z} \left(\frac{\rm Gyr}{t_{\rm dep}}\right)\right]^{1/6}$$
Redshift dependent

$$\begin{cases} M_{\rm g} = f_{\rm b}M(1 - \epsilon_{\star}) \\ {\rm SFR} = \epsilon_{\star}f_{\rm b}\left(\frac{dM}{dt}\right) & t_{\rm dep}(z) \propto (1 + z)^{-5/2} & T_{\rm d} \propto (1 + z)^{0.42} \\ {\rm Cosmic\ evolution\ from\ numerical\ simulations} \\ {\rm See:\ Fakhouri\ et\ al.\ 2010;\ Dekel\ {\ensurements}\ Krumholz\ 2013;\ Correa\ et\ al.\ 2015} \\ \end{cases}$$

$$\underline{\text{At given z:}} \begin{cases} T_{d} \propto [N_{H,21} \ t_{dep}^{-1}]^{1/6.03} \text{ K} & \tau_{uv} \lessapprox 1 \\ \\ T_{d} \propto [Z \ t_{dep}]^{-1/6.03} \text{ K} & \tau_{uv} \gtrsim 1 \end{cases}$$

$$\begin{cases} M_{g} = f_{b}M(1 - \epsilon_{\star}) \\ SFR = \epsilon_{\star}f_{b}\left(\frac{dM}{dt}\right) \\ Cosmic evolution from numerical simulations \\ See: Fakhouri et al. 2010; Dekel & Krumholz 2013; Correa et al. 2015 \end{cases}$$

$$\underline{\text{At given z:}} \begin{cases} \frac{T_{d} \propto [N_{H,21} \ t_{dep}^{-1}]^{1/6.03} \text{ K}}{T_{d} \propto [Z \ t_{dep}]^{-1/6.03} \text{ K}} & \tau_{uv} \lessapprox 1 \end{cases} \quad \text{UV-transparent} \\ T_{d} \propto [Z \ t_{dep}]^{-1/6.03} \text{ K} & \tau_{uv} \gtrsim 1 \end{cases}$$

$$\begin{cases} M_{g} = f_{b}M(1 - \epsilon_{\star}) \\ \text{SFR} = \epsilon_{\star}f_{b}\left(\frac{dM}{dt}\right) \quad t_{dep}(z) \propto (1 + z)^{-5/2} \quad T_{d} \propto (1 + z)^{0.42} \quad \text{Cosmic evolution} \\ \text{Cosmic evolution from numerical simulations} \\ \text{See: Fakhouri et al. 2010; Dekel & Krumholz 2013; Correa et al. 2015} \\ \end{cases}$$

<u>At given z:</u> ]

$$\left\{ T_{\rm d} \propto \left[ Z t_{\rm dep} \right]^{-1/6.03} \text{ K} \qquad \tau_{\rm uv} \gtrsim 1 \qquad \text{UV-obscured} \right.$$

#### <u>GMC model</u>:

- Uniform density
- Star forming
- Turbulent,  $\sigma$
- Pressure
  - supported, p
- $\alpha_{\rm vir} = 5/3$

### <u>GMC model</u>:

- Uniform density
- Star forming
- Turbulent, **o**
- Pressure
  - supported, p

• 
$$\alpha_{\rm vir} = 5/3$$











#### Uniform cloud



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)

Uniform cloud



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)

• Hotter dust due to high pressure at high-z



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)

Sommovigo+20

Hotter dust due to high pressure at high-z



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)

Hotter dust due to high pressure at high-z

$$au_\lambda \propto N_H \propto p^{1/2}$$



Hotter dust due to high pressure at high-z

$$au_\lambda \propto N_H \propto p^{1/2}$$

Dust is hotter due to compact dust configuration in high-z GMCs

Towards the center of the cloud

(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)





(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)


(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)



(MW grain size distribution: Weingartner & Draine, 2001)



From our model  $\mathbf{T}_d \ge 60$  K: higher than usually assumed ( $T_d = 25-35$  K)

#### MACS0416-Y1





From our model  $\mathbf{T}_d \ge 60$  K: higher than usually assumed ( $T_d = 25-35$  K)

#### MACS0416-Y1





#### **MACS0416-Y1**







## MACS0416-Y1

From our model  $\mathbf{T}_d \geq \mathbf{60} \ \mathbf{K}$ : higher than usually assumed ( $T_d = 25-35 \ \mathrm{K}$ )













### **Spatial separation** between UV and IR?

ID65666





Dust



#### **Spatial separation** between UV and IR? REBELS-19 ID65666 Dust Bowler+Inami+22UV Dust

**REBELS-12** 





-

Pallottini+22



Pallottini+22



Pallottini+22